



lim Halimatusa'diyah <iim_hs@uinjkt.ac.id>

Thank you for submitting your review of Manuscript ID CTWQ-2021-0851 for Third World Quarterly

1 pesan

Third World Quarterly <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

21 Maret 2022 22.26

Balas Ke: CTWQ-peerreview@journals.tandf.co.uk

Kepada: iim_hs@uinjkt.ac.id

21-Mar-2022

Dear Dr lim Halimatusa'diyah:

Thank you for reviewing "THE USE OF ZAKAT IN THE PANDEMIC RESPONSE:
THE CASE OF ISLAMIC RELIEF AND BAZNAS IN INDONESIA" for Third World Quarterly.

We appreciate the time you give to Third World Quarterly and hope you will continue to act as a referee for us. We would also be pleased to consider your own research papers if they are appropriate to our aims and scope.

Best wishes,

Siri Nylund

Third World Quarterly Editorial Office
CTWQ-peerreview@journals.tandf.co.uk



lim Halimatusa'diyah <iim_hs@uinjkt.ac.id>

Invitation from Third World Quarterly

1 pesan

Third World Quarterly <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

16 Maret 2022 22.01

Balas Ke: CTWQ-peerreview@journals.tandf.co.uk

Kepada: iim_hs@uinjkt.ac.id

16-Mar-2022

CTWQ-2021-0851

Dear Dr Iim Halimatusa'diyah:

A manuscript titled, "THE USE OF ZAKAT IN THE PANDEMIC RESPONSE: THE CASE OF ISLAMIC RELIEF AND BAZNAS IN INDONESIA", has been submitted to Third World Quarterly.

Given your expertise in this area, we would be grateful if you would be willing to act as a referee for this paper. We appreciate that the current exceptional circumstances may mean that you need longer than normal to review manuscripts and we are of course able to offer flexibility in the deadlines.

The abstract appears at the end of this email. Please let us know as soon as possible if you are able to accept our invitation to review. To do this, please click on the appropriate link below or email us with your reply.

*** PLEASE NOTE: This is a two-step process. After clicking on the link, you will be directed to a webpage to confirm.

Agreed: https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/ctwq?URL_MASK=55965ca38c974112848ddc678c3bcd47

Declined: https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/ctwq?URL_MASK=fa0f8f7f24e2447c8a1dda046e806412

Unavailable: https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/ctwq?URL_MASK=ae2f8d4698e8466d8a92a80032b9970c

Should you accept our invitation, you will be sent an email with a direct link to the scoresheet. You will then have access to the manuscript and reviewer instructions in your Reviewer Centre.

If you are unable to review the manuscript, please click on the "decline" option. This will direct you to a screen where you can provide details of any alternative reviewers - suggestions are always gratefully received.

Our reviewers help us to maintain the high standards of Third World Quarterly so thank you in advance for your assistance.

Best wishes,
Mustapha

Dr Mustapha Pasha
On behalf of Third World Quarterly
CTWQ-peerreview@journals.tandf.co.uk

MANUSCRIPT DETAILS

TITLE: THE USE OF ZAKAT IN THE PANDEMIC RESPONSE:
THE CASE OF ISLAMIC RELIEF AND BAZNAS IN INDONESIA

ABSTRACT:

Emergency created by the spread of the Covid-19 pandemic has provoked a mobilization of funds from different donors and actors across the world. Islamic tools, such as zakat or waqf, represent resources that have been deployed for responding to the needs of vulnerable communities. This study considers and compares two organizations: Islamic Relief and Badan Amil Zakat Nasional (BAZNAS) in Indonesia. The aim is to understand how a non-governmental organization (Islamic Relief) and national organization (BAZNAS) are collecting and redistributing zakat, comparing their programmes and approaches also during the Covid-19 crisis.



Iim Halimatusa'diyah <iim_hs@uinjkt.ac.id>

Third World Quarterly Reviewer notification of decision on Manuscript CTWQ-2021-0851

1 pesan

Third World Quarterly <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

7 April 2022 16.49

Balas Ke: CTWQ-peerreview@journals.tandf.co.uk

Kepada: CTWQ-peerreview@journals.tandf.co.uk

07-Apr-2022

Dear Reviewers,

Thank you for reviewing the manuscript CTWQ-2021-0851 entitled "THE USE OF ZAKAT IN THE PANDEMIC RESPONSE:

THE CASE OF ISLAMIC RELIEF AND BAZNAS IN INDONESIA" for Third World Quarterly. We greatly appreciate the voluntary contribution that each reviewer gives to the Journal and hope that we may continue to seek your assistance with the refereeing process for Third World Quarterly.

The decision that we arrived at for this article was: Major Revision, basing the decision on your review and those of the other referees.

A copy of your comments to the author, along with those of any other referees, follows at the end of this letter for your information. Any files that referees uploaded for the attention of the author are attached as a PDF proof.

Yours sincerely,

Madeleine

Dr Madeleine Hatfield
Managing Editor, Third World Quarterly
On behalf of the Academic Editors
CTWQ-peerreview@journals.tandf.co.uk

Referee comments to the author:

Referee: 1

Recommendation: Minor Revision

Comments:

This is a very interesting and at times illuminating comparison of Indonesian and UK zakat systems and also government versus non-state systems. There is much valuable information about the history and performance of various alms agencies as well as the British and Indonesian regulatory frameworks within which they must operate. The author writes with clarity and authority on these matters. But the manuscript is not as effective as a potential journal article as it might be. To begin with, the Abstract and Introduction fail to spell out the main line of argumentation that is to be pursued. The results in a certain lack of direction in parts of the text. How much is it about international assistance rather than domestic? Why is it important to compare BAZNAS in Indonesia to Islamic Relief Worldwide in the UK? Over the length of the article, answers gradually emerge to these questions but clear signposting should take place at the outset. The issue of argumentation is especially important, and this is nowhere more obvious than in the Conclusion, which consists chiefly of summarising dot points, as if this is a technical report rather than a scholarly article. I would urge the author to look beyond the technical aspects of zakat provision and ponder further the greater significance of their findings.

Several other matters also need attention. All Arabic terms should be translated and for the sake of readability, I would suggest the author seek to minimise the use of foreign terms. Graphics are provided for Islamic Relief but not for BAZNAS. The Indonesian data would be more digestible if they could be presented in charts, as for UK. The use of bold is excessive and I would suggest it is best eliminated entirely.

Additional Questions:

As a thank you and to acknowledge the contribution of our reviewers, the journal may publish a list of the names of those who have reviewed at the end of the year. This will not be linked to any specific paper and will only be done if the list of reviewers is long enough to protect the anonymity of the review process for individual papers. If you would prefer for your name not to be included in a published list of reviewers, please indicate this below.: Do not include my name

Referee: 2

Recommendation: Major Revision

Comments:

This is an interesting article about faith-based organizations managed by non-government and government institutions and their works on collecting and redistributing zakat, comparing their programs and approaches during the Covid-19 crisis. While it would certainly be of interest to Third World Quarterly readers. However, it needs major revision before it can be published here and the author/s need to work harder to upgrade the quality of the paper first.

Substantive aspects:

Introduction: the author/s need to provide a clearer background of the study by showing why this study is interesting and reviewing previous studies on the issue to show the niche of the study and what contribution this study is going to offer. While the study is very descriptive in design, I think, the author/s need clearly state what are their research questions. In the abstract, the author/s clearly states that the aims of this study “ The aim is to understand how a non-governmental organization (Islamic Relief) and national organization (BAZNAS) are collecting and redistributing zakat, comparing their programmes and approaches also during the Covid-19 crisis?”. It is still unclear why describing their program and approaches are important? It would be more interesting if the authors formulate clear research questions such as the extent to which faith-based organizations respond to the Covid-19 crisis? or how is the role of faith-based organizations in dealing with the impacts of the Covid-19 crisis? If focusing on the impacts, the authors also need to specify what impacts they want to address? economic impact? health impact? psychological impact? or since the author/s uses two different types of organizations, they could also ask which organizations perform better? The one organized by the state (BAZNAS) or by NGO/CSO (Islamic Relief)? And why it is better? The author/s also need to clearly state their main argument in the paper and present the structure of the paper.

Method: it needs major revision. The author/s mainly only shortlist some points that are still unclear to explain the method of the study. The author/s need to explain in detail how they collect the data, who were the informants and how they selected the informant, how data were gathered from these informants, how the data were analyzed, and how they triangulated the data to ensure the reliability of the data. Since the author/s used two different types of organizations from different countries, it is also necessary to explain why they chose these organizations as the cases.

The author/s also need to provide a sub-heading entitled “study context” to explain basic information about these organizations (it include how they collect the zakat, how much fund they have been collected, and what are their programs), as well as the countries in which these organizations run their activities.

Next, the author/s need to restructure their article into sub-headings that answer their research questions. They might create sub-headings based on the category per organization, or based on the themes that emerge from their data analysis and discuss these findings by comparing and relating them to broader literature in this issue. The conclusion should provide a summary of the findings, the contribution of the study, the limitations of the study, and how to address these limitations in their study or further study.

Technical aspects:

The article also needs really thorough proofreading for English grammar and a sense.

The author/s have listed many points. Instead of shortlisting, the author must write comprehensive and compelling paragraphs.

Additional Questions:

As a thank you and to acknowledge the contribution of our reviewers, the journal may publish a list of the names of those who have reviewed at the end of the year. This will not be linked to any specific paper and will only be done if the list of reviewers is long enough to protect the anonymity of the review process for individual papers. If you would prefer for your name not to be included in a published list of reviewers, please indicate this below.: Do not include my name